An Institutional Analysis of Gundalav Lake Governance

By: Megha Sanjaliwala, Dr. Mansee Bal Bhargava

Asia Region Biennial IASC Meeting, July 2018
AIM of the Study

To understand urban lake sustainability through lake governance for the Gundalav Lake in Kishangarh city of Rajasthan
The Institutional Analysis and Development (IAD) framework developed by Elinor Ostrom has been described as "one of the most developed and sophisticated attempts to use institutional and stakeholder assessment in order to link theory and practice, analysis and policy" (Cole, 2014).

Source: E. Ostrom, 2010
The IAD Framework has been applied to analyse the opportunities and constraints in the current lake governance effort taken for the Gundalav Talab of Kishangarh, Rajasthan.
URBAN SETTINGS OF KISHANGARH

• Kishangarh about 100 km south to Jaipur and 30km north to Ajmer.
• Founded by the Jodhpur prince Kishan Singh in 1609.
• Kishangarh is called as the marble town of India. The economy largely depends on the marble industry.
• Kishangarh is located on Aravalli ranges plateau terrain.
• Gundalav Lake is a perennial shallow freshwater body situated in the South-west of Kishangarh. It is about 120 hectares (1.2 sq km) in area.
GUNDALAV LAKE TIMELINE

- **2002**: National Lake Conservation Plan (NLCP) launched
- **2010**: For phase II of NLCP, State decided to send DPR of Gundalav Talab
- **2012**: DPR prepared as per NLCP by State
- **2013**: NLCP was merged with NWCP and National Plan for Conservation of Aquatic Eco-systems (NPCA) was created. State informed the GOI of funding availability and consider the proposal
- **2015**: Rajasthan Lakes (Protection and Development) Authority Act was created
- **2016**: New funding pattern as per NPCA was arranged by State and appealed the GOI for approval and remaining funding.
- **2017**: GOI advised to revise the DPR too as per NPCA and resubmit

Images: Pre monsoon-2006, Pre monsoon-2016
Biophysical Characteristics

1. **Designation Of Urban Lakes** -
   - Helps the ULBs recognize the number of urban water bodies within its judiciary and makes them accountable for them.

2. **Delineation Of Urban Lakes**
   - What to delineate for sustainability of water body? Lake or lake system or System of lakes?

3. **Flows into and out of lake - rainwater harvesting & wastewater**
   - The main source of water in the lake is rainwater and surface runoff since it affects the quality and quantity of water.
   - Absence of centralized drainage system in the town, so the grey water wastage of the town is directly/indirectly leading to the lakes.

Source: (Bal, 2015)
Attributes of Communities

Socio-economic attributions
- Heterogeneous & homogeneous group of lake users
- Governance faces a challenge to create a harmony in the facilities that could be permitted (or restricted)
- Economical center for Marble, cotton fabric and agricultural produce.
- Reflects in Demographic growth of 33% in a decade.

Rule compliance and Public conscience
- People’s willingness to get involved in the governance process is creating awareness
- Still public participation is limited due to – Change of lifestyle
- Perception of role as Users and Government as providers.
- In spite of presence of several laws the lack of sincerity, trust and understanding reflect in weak implementation.

Knowledge of resource, social capital and information sharing
- The perception created in the mental models of people is that of being the users of the service (lake) that is made available to them by the government. Thus there is a willingness to user fees.
- The Gundalav Talab has multiple indirect resources such as usage of ground water, lake edge to create public spaces, water body for animals of surrounding minor communities
- The water body is also given the religious status in days of festivals.
- Promote tourism in Kishangarh with help of Mokham Villa and the presence of Fort.
- It is observed that currently there is no single platform where all these various users could interact with each other.
Rajasthan Governance structure

Rules-in-use
The Rajasthan Municipalities Act (1994)

District Planning Committees (33 Districts)

Ajmer District

Tehsil Level

Tehsils (9)

Municipality level (ULB)

Kishangarh (31)

74th amendment (1993)

The Rajasthan Municipalities Act (1994)

Central level

State Level

District Planning Committees (33 Districts)

Ajmer District

Tehsil Level

Tehsils (9)

Municipality level (ULB)

Kishangarh (31)

JNNURM, 2005

RUIS, 2004

Rajasthan Lake Development Authority, 2015

RUIDFCO, 2010

RUIDP, 2004

RUIS, 2004
1. National Lake Development Plan (NLCP) → National Plan on Conservation of Aquatic Ecosystem (NCPA)

Launch by the Ministry of Environment & Forest (MoE&F), Government of India and being implemented since 2001, for conservation and management of polluted and degraded lakes in urban and semi-urban areas. It is now merged and been substituted by National Plan on Conservation of Aquatic Ecosystem (NPCA) since 2013.

2. The inter-department coordination (RLDA, 2015)
2. JnNURM
Facilitates funding for city infrastructure development and lake integration management with other departments.

3. Property rights
- Lake property divided into land of the lake (DC) and the water (MoEF, MoWR, SID).
- Since the rights belong to a distant authority, the local authority is hesitant in prohibiting its deterioration as a cesspool or being encroached by squatters.

4. Networking activities- Internationally & Nationally (locally)
- Rules like Ramsar Convention propagate IWRM which is adopted by NLCP 2004.
- Restoration funds came from International networking and ULBs are motivated to generate funds for maintenance.
- Funds are generated by peripheral activities and leasing but then maintenance of lake ecosystem is overshadowed.

Additional characteristics influencing the governance of Gundalav Talab

1. Heritage Value
- Presence of Fort and Mokham villa- Jaipur Heritage Cell

2. Characteristics of upstream and downstream
- Both are different so importance of lake is different for them

3. Urban Development & Land value
- Due to the urban development pattern, land value is higher away from the lake
- Lake is secluded from infrastructure planning and starts deteriorating
• The Kishangarh master plan was prepared on the basis of population projection, and economic plan for the town.
• Resource availability is not considered while planning. Resource requirements are stated in terms to sustain the strategic plan.
• Instead of ULBs providing a town planning map and consolidating it in one District plan, the opposite is being implemented due to lack of capacity building within the ULBs.
• The lake development plan being prepared by parallel officials is then overlapped/fitted in the town planning.
• Both process progress at different paces resulting in difficulty to create synchronization.

We are a small municipality. We do what the authorities tell us to do. We have no decision power. Usually over recommendations are overheard by the Authorities.

No internal coordination
**Discussion**

A summary of understanding of the whole study has been below-

**Condition**

**Precedents**

- **Bio-physical conditions:** Gundalav Talab creates a microclimate and is an important part of the current lifestyle of people. It has been in ignorant stage since a decade and the city developments has affected it to worsen the situation.

- **Attributes of People:** Lake existence awareness is not seen. Communication gap between different social groups is observed.

- **Rules-in-use:** Collective Action is currently top-down approach. Local leadership could be generated.

**Action**

**Arena**

- **Action Situations:** City Planning done isolating the lake. Infrastructure planning done based on city planning. Lake sustainability/maintenance missing

- **Actors:** ULBs lack decision authority. Communities have no role in current governance. Organisations efforts are fragmented.

**Patterns of Interaction**

- Due to top-down approach, the users have no clarity of lake restoration plan. Social-Ecological interactions are not considered due to lack of understanding.

- **Evaluation Criteria:** no common evaluation criteria is shared amongst the Actors

The IAD framework helps one to organize the understanding and look at the causal relation between Governance and sustainability.
Recommendations

• There is an urgent need of the water quality maintenance of the lake which directs to the immediate construction of a STP on the basis of recent database.
• Case related understanding of what lake delineation for sustainability should address.
• During the study it was observed that lake sustainability awareness is seen in people.
• The study here challenges for a further action of conscience building. Awakening amongst people to get into action is required.
• Lack of association of people with the lake can be addressed through the involvement of KMA, Royal Family, Temple trust, NGOs, Media etc

Introduction of Tools where local stakeholders are equal partners
• Incentivize KMA, local business groups
• Facilitate implementation of CSR with the help of PPP for Maintenance of lake/STP (secondary duties) as per the RLDA
• Platform to celebrate lake existence.

Understanding from study-
• Polycentricism should be harnessed instead of linear models
• Level play tools to be introduced at operational level to change the perception of government as providers and people as users (misusers).
• Studying lake sustainability does not limit to studying the physical lake but its geo-spatial setting and socio-economic

Way Forward-
• How to design these tools where KMA, ULBs, communities could enact as level playing?
THANK YOU
Bibliography:


Bibliography:


PTI. (2017, January 10). Warming of Indian Ocean behind groundwater decline in India. The Economic Times.